



Climate Equity TWG Meeting #2 Summary

Monday, April 23, 2018

5:00 PM-6:00 PM

Online Meeting

Facilitators: Nils Frenkel (Navigant), Danielle Vitoff (Navigant), Eloisa Portillo-Morales (City of San Antonio)

Recap: the Vision and Priorities

- Review of synthesized vision from Steering Committee and Technical Working Groups:
 - Innovative and forward-looking
 - San Antonio specific (focus on equity)
 - Broad community engagement and buy-in
 - A community where all residents are Climate Ready
- Review of Climate Equity TWG's Vision
 - Accountable, transparent, and adjusts to ongoing community needs
 - Underrepresented are represented at all levels of policy making
 - Empower community-leaders
- Review of Climate Equity TWG's Priorities
 - Focus on health and quality of life, partner with community health workers
 - Listen to and educate as many people as possible before making recommendations (open to the community)
 - Connect communities around trusted leaders and individually-crafted messages.
 - Address the "fear of doing good"
 - Look at assets we have and build upon them, i.e. recycling, composting, renewable energy, conservation, transportation
 - Set a process to visually track progress through implementation
- Comments/Q&A:
 - Q: Will we continue to add to this list?/A: Yes, this is an ongoing list.
 - There needs to be community ownership in decision-making. It should not be just low level of engagement through education and gathering people's thoughts. It is more than just listening.
 - "Fear of doing good" was not the right sentiment. A lot of communities are doing things we would consider sustainable.
- Introduction to Danielle Vitoff, Navigant's Project Manager for the CAAP
- Focus on an audacious goal; a lot of work to be done for the CAAP in a short period of time
- Conducted online polling to collect feedback about additional Vision and Priorities
 - "Prioritize interests and needs of most vulnerable and least culpable"
 - "I would like to see if we can include language that specifies the importance of equity across the lifespan."
 - "Develop equity scan"
 - "Such as Portland's 9 points"

Administration: Process, Timeline, and Expectations

- Reviewed timeline through February 2019
- 2-month looping process between online and in-person meetings
- Homework will be assigned at each meeting so that pertinent input can be gathered, recorded, and made available to the planning process

- Reviewed Steering Committee Chair and Technical Working Group Liaisons:
 - Anita Ledbetter, Steering Committee Chair
 - Dr. Olufemi Osidele, Energy & Buildings TWG Liaison
 - Jeffrey Arndt, Transportation & Land Use TWG Liaison
 - Sara Beesley, Water & Natural Resources TWG Liaison
 - Jessica Guerrero, Climate Equity TWG Liaison
 - Dr. Carlos A. Garcia, Waste & Consumption TWG Liaison

2016 GHG Inventory Update, Projections, and Target

- Reviewed key differences between 2014 and 2016 protocol requirements.
- With the data received to date, the 2016 GHG Community Inventory is projected to be between -8% to +8% from the 2014 GHG Community Inventory.
- There might be a slight decrease, but data will continue to be refined. Reason for potential decrease could be attributed to milder temperatures in 2016 and a cleaner fuel mix from CPS Energy.
- Most likely, there will also be a slight decrease in per capita GHG emissions.
- Per GPD emissions will most likely be significantly lower due to the increase in population and potential decrease in emissions.
- Emissions in the buildings sector reduced slightly while transportation emissions increased slightly. Other sectors remained relatively the same.
- San Antonio Business-as-Usual (BAU) assumptions used for the 2014 inventory are currently being used for the 2016 inventory. Feedback requested for BAU assumptions.
 - Additional considerations/comments/Q&A:
 - Energy use per capita is not the same throughout the city. Certain sectors of the city consume much more energy per capita than others.
 - Q: What is the assumption for EV adoption?/A: Still building out that model with additional data sources.

Equity Framework and Community Engagement

- Pulled from best practice examples from other cities to draft the equity framework.
 - Center Equity in the CAAP and process
 - Capacity to Center Equity in CAAP
 - Frame CAAP Goals & Mission around reducing disparities and increasing equity
 - Build Broad Community Support & Leadership for Implementation Action
 - CAAP Mitigation and Adaptation Strategies Equity Assessment
 - CAAP Climate Equity Metrics (ensure that outcome and actions are based around equity and understand if we are actually making an impact and reducing disparities)
 - Continue to build relationships and collaborate with community through implementation
- Poll question: What does the CAAP definition of equity need to include?



- Reviewed Equity Framework Timeline
 - The chart on slide 35 demonstrates how this TWG's work will align with the overall CAAP Process
 - Feedback requested on the timeline
- Overview of April Community Engagement Activities
 - CAAP team met with and presented to numerous organizations and had a presence at many public events, collecting vision and priorities feedback
- Comments/Q&A:
 - Q: What are the specific disparities we are considering? It should include chronic disease./A: The Climate Equity TWG should identify those, but it could include income segregation, life expectancy based on zip code, urban heat island effect, etc.
 - Actively address displacement rather than exacerbate the issue

Homework, Takeaways, and Next Steps

- Homework for next meeting due on Friday, May 11th:
 - To begin drafting a shared definition of equity, we would like to hear from you all what the most important components, statements, that you feel should be included as we collectively draft a definition to share with the other groups and public.
 - Community Engagement: Provide feedback on potential events or collaboration opportunities for engagement.
- Feedback to be sent to eloisa.portillo-morales@sanantonio.gov or danielle.vitoff@navigant.com
- Additional resources are listed on slide 39.
- Next meeting is on Monday, May 21st from 5:00-7:00pm at 1400 S. Flores Main Conference Room.

Additional Comments

- Prioritize the interest of the least culpable and the most vulnerable
- Regarding equity metrics, we need to realize that there are other social factors that contribute to those inequities that may be beyond the scope of what we can do in this plan. (e.g. if life expectancy is chosen, lack of access and lack of health insurance would also be a contributing factor)
 - Response: Agreed. The TWG should decide on the disparities that are important.
- There should be a review of the water rates and the extent to which inequity within the city has to do with the way various people are billed. What is the proportion of people who get notices of their service being cut off? How do we get this data?
- Would like to know who has been approved or denied for weatherization program funding
- The San Antonio Food Bank appreciates being included in the dialogue
- There was a group discussion about coordinating a Climate Equity Sub-Committee meeting before the May 21st in-person meeting. Meeting will be on Friday, May 11th at 4:00-5:30 at 1400 S. Flores (Main Conference Room).